"The "Modern Marco Polo" Visits a Colonial Police State: Harrison Forman and Government Public Relations in Japanese Ruled Taiwan."


Paul D. Barclay, Lafayette College

Abstract

On April 1, 1938, the photo journalist and travelogue writer Harrison Forman began a short tour of Taiwan. Only a few photographs from Forman’s excursion were published, as part of his 1940 Horizon Hunter: The Adventures of a Modern Marco Polo. Recently, however, over sixty additional photo negatives from this 1938 visit have been made available to researchers. Like the published photos, a great majority of Forman’s unpublished photographs were of Taiwan Indigenous Peoples. By 1938, wrote Forman, Taiwan had become a police state ruled by suspicion, secrecy, and fear. Nonetheless, the intrusive colonial state encouraged the production and dissemination of photographs of a certain type. This paper analyzes Forman’s unpublished travel notes and photographs, along with those of contemporary Western visitors to Taiwan, to ask why the Indigenous Territories, which had symbolized Japan’s shortcomings as a colonizer from the 1900s through the 1920s, had become the Government General’s preferred window upon the colony in the late 1930s.

I. Introduction

Guns have metamorphosed into cameras in this earnest comedy, the ecology safari, because nature has ceased to be what it always had been—what people needed protection from. Now nature—tamed, endangered, mortal—needs to be protected from people. When we are afraid, we shoot. But when we are nostalgic, we take pictures.¹

The months following the Marco Polo (Lugouqiao) Incident were trying ones for Japanese officials charged with securing favorable press in the American news media. Coverage of civilian deaths in and around the battlefields of coastal China were tilting U.S. public opinion against Japan.² The work of Harrison Forman, the MARCH OF TIME newsreel photographer who

provided the world with close-up footage of the 14 August 1937 Hotel Cathay bombings in
Shanghai and related carnage, was but one example of the type of uncensored reportage
damaging Japan's reputation. A writer for the cinema section of *Time* described Forman's out-
sized impact, reporting that his newsreels

plunged [U.S. cinemagoers] into such a bloodbath of visual horrors as few of them had ever imagined. Shown throughout the U. S. these were the first frankly gruesome newsreels of the Shanghai shambles to reach the U. S. ...After a shell burst in a crowded street, corpses bright with blood and rows of grimy bodies, barely distinguishable from the dusty wreckage, clutter the smashed sidewalk. Stinking human garbage (the street-cleaners have tied handkerchiefs around their mouths and noses), big chunks of it insufficiently wrapped, is dumped on open trucks. Later, as the trucks are unloaded, the still-warm, flexible dead are flopped out like a big catch of fish. . . .

Wrongly forecasting a hasty Chinese surrender after the August fighting described in the
above quote, Forman returned to the United States to cash in on his Shanghai exploits as a "Far East expert" on the lecture circuit (see Fig. 1). In 1938, he returned to East Asia looking for new angles on the expanding China War. On April 1, Forman flew from Tokyo to Taiwan to gather news from "the base for all Japan's aerial and naval operations against South China." And it was here, at Taihoku airport, that the famous American newsreel photographer and publicity-hound entered the realm of a notoriously camera-shy colonial security apparatus.

---


At first blush, one would guess that this improbable encounter would end with a brusque rejection of Forman's request to enter. During the decade preceding Forman's arrival, a number of foreigners had faced arrest or other forms of unwanted police attention for bringing cameras to the empire's shorelines, ports and other designated "strategic strongholds." By the same token, Forman's resume, which included a stint as an aircraft salesmen and member of the Shanghai

---

Volunteer Corps in the early 1930s, not to mention his recent work as photographer in Tibet and coastal China, did not portend a warm reception from the police responsible for tracking foreigners' movements in Taiwan. Despite these inauspicious beginnings, Foreman got his pictures in the end, and the Taiwan Government General garnered favorable publicity from the pen of a foreign correspondent in the bargain. Given the tight surveillance that Forman worked under, it is not surprising that the Taiwan chapters of Forman's 1940 *Horizon Hunter: The Adventures of a Modern Marco Polo* lacked references to Japanese brutality on a par with that captured in his 1937 newsreel photography of the Shanghai bombings. As noted in his published remarks, Forman had thrust himself into a colony under martial law. For Taiwan was more than a naval and air base for the China War: It was also home to millions of colonial subjects sympathetic to the plight of Japan's victims and enemies on the continent. But Forman's published account went beyond circumspection and omission, and shaded into active support for the colonial regime. The striking contrast between Forman's rambling, whimsical and occasionally laudatory published account and the dire circumstances under which it was written raises a number of questions.

Contrary to first appearances, Forman's arrival in Taiwan presented a complex challenge to Japanese officials. And their dilemma cut to the heart of a central tension in Japanese public relations efforts during the war years. On the one hand, journalists, photographers, and other publicists were essential for the propagation of information that would promote sympathy for Japanese policies abroad and rally domestic support. On the other hand, persistent fears that

---

10 Even as late as 1943, Japanese officials were reticent to shut down publications with a history of critical editorials—like *Kaizō* and *Chūō Kōron*—because they needed platforms for propaganda, and therefore preferred to
national security was being undermined by foreign shutter-bugs and disloyal subjects, which found expression in the frequent application of Japan's 1899 "Military Facilities Protection Law" and "Ordinance on Military Zones," entailed a policy of prohibitions aimed at tourists, journalists, and consular officials. The detailed record Forman left of his experience at the vortex of these cross-currents, in the form of an unpublished journal, his archived photographic negatives, and two published book chapters based on his travels, provides an occasion to examine the manner in which Japanese policemen and their supervisors managed the empire's image abroad.

This essay argues that Harrison Forman's treatment at the hands of policemen in colonial Taiwan, and his subsequent published account, exemplify a largely successful public relations strategy. To wit, Forman's relatively upbeat published account of Japanese rule in Taiwan, written in the face of damning evidence contained in his journal, was occasioned by two factors. First, dominant American and Japanese worldviews vis-à-vis colonized peoples of the world ca. 1938 were similar enough to make Forman, and presumably his readers, sympathetic to Japan's cause in Taiwan's interior, home to non-Chinese inhabitants known at the time as "aborigines" "head-hunters" and "savages." The gathering storm in Japan-US relations surrounding the

_co-opt, rather than crush, such publications. Local or district Police, or patriotic groups, on the other hand, could apply pressure to upper echelon officials to close them down (which actually happened in 1944). See Janice Matsumura, More than a Momentary Nightmare: The Yokohama Incident and Wartime Japan, pp. 40-41. Officials wanting to burnish Japan's image abroad through tourism (a project backed by the Railway Ministry) were in a similar manner frustrated by heavy-handed police tactics for restricting foreign access to Japan. See Kushner, Thought War, pp. 39; 53. An item from the January 9, 1929 issue of the Yomiuri Shinbun (page 7) also suggests that blunt policies of censorship and restriction were applied only after some deliberation because such actions deprived the state of conduits for publicity. When it was discovered that a small-scale publisher was distributing postcards of an airfield near Yokosuka Harbor, the cards were not only confiscated, but the base was sealed off from the general public. Before the incident, visitors were granted access in order to propagate "airbase consciousness" (kūkō shisō senden no tame ni) among the public.

The detailed record Forman left of his experience at the vortex of these cross-currents, in the form of an unpublished journal, his archived photographic negatives, and two published book chapters based on his travels, provides an occasion to examine the manner in which Japanese policemen and their supervisors managed the empire's image abroad.

This essay argues that Harrison Forman's treatment at the hands of policemen in colonial Taiwan, and his subsequent published account, exemplify a largely successful public relations strategy. To wit, Forman's relatively upbeat published account of Japanese rule in Taiwan, written in the face of damning evidence contained in his journal, was occasioned by two factors. First, dominant American and Japanese worldviews vis-à-vis colonized peoples of the world ca. 1938 were similar enough to make Forman, and presumably his readers, sympathetic to Japan's cause in Taiwan's interior, home to non-Chinese inhabitants known at the time as "aborigines" "head-hunters" and "savages." The gathering storm in Japan-US relations surrounding the

_co-opt, rather than crush, such publications. Local or district Police, or patriotic groups, on the other hand, could apply pressure to upper echelon officials to close them down (which actually happened in 1944). See Janice Matsumura, More than a Momentary Nightmare: The Yokohama Incident and Wartime Japan, pp. 40-41. Officials wanting to burnish Japan's image abroad through tourism (a project backed by the Railway Ministry) were in a similar manner frustrated by heavy-handed police tactics for restricting foreign access to Japan. See Kushner, Thought War, pp. 39; 53. An item from the January 9, 1929 issue of the Yomiuri Shinbun (page 7) also suggests that blunt policies of censorship and restriction were applied only after some deliberation because such actions deprived the state of conduits for publicity. When it was discovered that a small-scale publisher was distributing postcards of an airfield near Yokosuka Harbor, the cards were not only confiscated, but the base was sealed off from the general public. Before the incident, visitors were granted access in order to propagate "airbase consciousness" (kūkō shisō senden no tame ni) among the public.

11 These laws were promulgated to punish the transmission of information about topography near military bases or military installations themselves; the laws established fines and/or imprisonment rules for unauthorized photography, copying, surveying, and the oral transmission of sensitive information. The complete text of each regulation was published on page 2 of the July 16 1899 issue of the Yomiuri Shinbun.

12 These images are posted at: American Geographical Society Digital Archive, Asia and Middle East (Milwaukee, WI: University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee), http://www4.uwm.edu/libraries/digilib/agsphoto/index.cfm (accessed October 5, 2010).
"China Question" could not conceal the fact that most Japanese and Americans—at least those who wrote for mainstream media and worked in propaganda departments—found nothing objectionable about the violent subjugation and intrusive management of peoples thought to be incapable of governing themselves. As fellow imperialist powers, these two countries were "intimate enemies."\(^\text{13}\)

Secondly, Foreman's story illustrates the power of photography as a conduit of meaning in Japan of the late 1930s. By providing photographic access to selected areas of the interior and plying journalists like Forman with richly illustrated pamphlets, attractive postcards, and photograph-studded English-language digests of Japanese policy, the colonial state sent their pampered guests home with evidence that produced an unambiguous cumulative effect. By 1940, when Forman's Taiwan chapters were published, photographs had accrued an evidentiary status in the discourse on law and security sufficient to outweigh contrary oral or written testimony in the Japanese justice system, and beyond, it would appear.\(^\text{14}\) In the interim between experience and write-up, what amounted to a Japanese press kit on life and government in highland Taiwan, combined with footage and snapshots he himself created in model villages under strict supervision, displaced and overruled Forman's ambiguous and inconclusive hand-scrawled notes. The result was a battle-tested newsreel correspondent's portrait of Japan's island naval base that scarcely mentioned the war. Moreover, Forman's photographs and newsreels, even as an

\(^{13}\) Akira Iriye makes a similar observation in his discussion of U.S. and Japanese war plans for the colonized territories in the early 1940s. Neither country's officialdom could countenance the idea of independence for colonial territories, each believing that national interests overrode the categorical imperative of self-determination. See Power and Culture: The Japanese-American War, 1941-1945 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1981).

\(^{14}\) Matsumura, Momentary Nightmare, p. 18. John Tagg has written: "'evidential force'...is exercised by photographs only within certain institutional practices and within particular historical relations, the investigation of which will take us far from an aesthetic or phenomenological context." The Burden of Representation: Essays on Photographies and Histories (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993), p. 4.
unpublished body of work, produced a pictorial record of the island that obscured, if not erased, its connections to the continent.

II. The Guided Tour and the Royal Treatment

From the mid-1930s onward, Japanese police reports forwarded to military authorities listed infractions of photographic regulations as serious breaches of security and included detailed information on the movements of visiting foreigners with cameras.\(^{15}\) As expected, then, Forman was greeted by gendarmes upon landing in Taipei for a thorough examination of his travel papers.\(^{16}\) Just getting off the plane put Forman in a sensitive area. One of Forman's hosts in Taiwan, US Consul Gerald Warner, wrote that private automobiles were not allowed to approach the airport, and that the Consul himself had to travel in a taxi with a Japanese driver in order to board planes in Taiwan.\(^{17}\) Forman himself also noted, with grudging admiration, that foreigners flew domestically in Taiwan in shuttered planes, to prevent visitors from committing strategically useful information to memory.\(^{18}\) Under such conditions, Forman's sighting of several attack planes and aerial bombers on the tarmac at Taihoku airport, recorded in the beginning of his published account, elicited much excitement, as he wrote:

"We landed on the military airport—right smack in the midst of squadrons of pursuits and big bombers, all heavily loaded and lined up ready for a China "egg-laying" expedition. My hunch was right—Taihoku airport was Japan's base for all aerial operations in South China!"\(^{19}\)

\(^{15}\) Haruyama Meitetsu, ed., Taiwantō naijōhō hontōjin no dōkō (Internal Reports on the Activities of Taiwanese) 台湾島内情報・本島人の動向 in Jūgonen sensō gokuhi shiryōshū 19 (15-year War Top Secret Documents Collection vol. 19) 十五年戦争極秘資料 (15, Tokyo: Funi shuppan, 1990), pp. 4,15-16,26,36-37,59-61,76-77, 91. I would like to thank Professor Caroline Hui-yu Ts'ai for introducing this important set of documents to me.

\(^{16}\) Forman, Horizon Hunter, p. 216.

\(^{17}\) Gerald Warner, "Typescript of Letter from Sulu Sea to Family and Friends," July 6, 1938, Gerald and Rella Warner Collection, Skillman Library Special Collections.

\(^{18}\) Forman, Horizon Hunter, p. 230.

\(^{19}\) Forman, Horizon Hunter, p. 216; It had been known to Westerners that southern Taiwan was home to important air bases, and that Japan had been militarizing the island, even before the Marco Polo Bridge Incident. It was also
Despite the apparent import of Forman's observation—after all, he came to Taiwan to learn more about the China War—he chose not to provide details about the planes and weapons he spotted, or how much had already been known about them. One of Forman's acquaintances in Taiwan, Rella Warner (wife of US Consul Gerald Warner), recalled watching these bombers fly out daily from her home at the Consulate, bombs strapped to wings. She recalled seeing 16 to 18 flights leave per day, and that the round trip took 5 to 6 hours. She also wrote about "disastrous results for Nanking."\textsuperscript{20} One assumes that Forman and the Warners discussed the military situation in East Asia from time to time during the former's stay in Taiwan.

In contrast to his terse and vague description of the warplanes at Taihoku Airport, Forman's account of his flight to Taiwan was detailed, specific, and even rambling. Moreover, its content was public knowledge, and could have been lifted straight from a 1937 tourist guide on Taiwan. Even the guide, which exhorted tourists to visit Taiwan, corroborated Forman's laments about a zealous security apparatus. Its air-travel section concluded with a stern warning: "the Japanese government strictly prohibits the taking of photographs or films… in [flight]. Passengers are requested to deposit their cameras or other photograph apparata for the duration of the flight."\textsuperscript{21}

Forman's camera, then, was probably confiscated before departure in Tokyo and returned to him upon landing in Taipei. To explain how he made it beyond security with his camera in full view, Forman claimed to have tricked Japanese officials by expressing interest in Taiwan's

\footnote{clear that such fortifications were built under the tightest security that Japan could muster. See Hallett Abend, "Hongkong to Rival Formosa as a Base," \textit{The New York Times}, April 20, 1937, p. 6. Whether Forman's sighting was as startling as he intimated in his book chapter is a question that awaits further research.}


\footnote{Naito, Hideo. \textit{Taiwan, A Unique Colonial Record. 1937-38} (Tokyo: Kokusai Nihon Kyōkai, 1938), pp.322-23 .}
"headhunters." Forman's rendering of his hosts' reasoning contained an element of truth. He attributed the following thoughts to his Japanese minders:

"...it might be advisable to take this crazy American at his word and shoot him up into the interior—well escorted, of course—to take silly pictures of aborigines, and thus have him out of the military's way, and still under surveillance."22

Unbeknownst to Foreman, he was one in a long line of Western visitors who had been ushered into Taiwan's mountains to take pictures of Indigenous Peoples in the full knowledge that such pictures would be published abroad. It is probable that Japanese officials had arranged Forman's itinerary before he even left Tokyo. Forman's picture-taking itinerary, like those of his predecessors, was largely spent at model villages, trading posts, isolated inns, lodges, and on push-cart rails. It is clear from the writings of such visitors, Forman included, that the act of personally photographing peoples "recently cured of head-hunting" imparted the sense that a hidden world's veil had been pierced. The figure of the vanquished head-hunter supplied visitors with the lure of exotic danger tempered by assurances they could return safely to work by Monday morning. To extend the life and reach of the transitory tourist experience, the picturesque elements of mountainous Taiwan—both its cultural bounty and natural beauty—were made portable for later consumption and re-circulation in the forms of cheaply obtained souvenir handicrafts, color postcards, and government-press photo albums.23

Conforming to a long established pattern of travelogue writing about Taiwan, then,

Forman began his story with remarks about the train-ride from Taipei to Daxi, the jumping-off

22 Harrison Forman, Horizon Hunter, p. 217.
23 For more details about these visitors, see Paul D. Barclay, Peddling Postcards and Selling Empire: Image-Making in Taiwan under Japanese Colonial Rule. Japanese Studies 30,1 (May 2010):81-110. One of the earlier visitors to receive such treatment, the school teacher cum weekend ethnologist Janet McGovern, who traveled between 1916 and 1918, found her minders to be bumbling, and left Taiwan with the impression that the Japanese would eventually exterminate the Indigenous Peoples. See Janet B. McGovern, Among the Head-Hunters of Formosa (London: T.F. Unwin, 1922), p. 63; 198. At the other end of the temporal and ideological spectrum, mountaineer W.H. Murray Walton, who visited in 1930 and also received logistical support and surveillance from Japanese police, could not praise Japanese policies towards the Indigenous peoples highly enough. See W.H. Murray Walton, Scrambles in Japan and Formosa (London: Edward Arnold & Co., 1934), pp. 39-42.
point for the push-cart ride to Mount Kappan (Jiaobanshan), perhaps the most photographed ethnic tourist site in Taiwan. Striking a chord he would often repeat, Forman praised the colonial government for its efficient railway system.\textsuperscript{24} Without it, needless to say, Forman was helpless. To get footage of the "seven major nations of aborigines living in the interior" Forman flew from port to port and took these short rail trips up the mountains from various approaches.\textsuperscript{25}

Forman's first mention of head-hunting—ostensibly the topic of his book chapter "No Headhunters in Formosa?"—recounted an orchestrated photo session of Sao pestle musicians on the shores of Sun Moon Lake.

![Figure 2](Harrison Forman and Musicians at Sun Moon Lake)

From the American Geographical Society Library, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee Libraries. Harrison Forman Collection—Taiwan, American Geographical Society Digital Archive, Asia and Middle East (Milwaukee, WI: University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee), Digital ID: fr200097

\textsuperscript{24} Forman, \textit{Horizon Hunter}, p. 218.

\textsuperscript{25} Forman, \textit{Horizon Hunter}, p. 230.
Forman's interpreter, a Mr. Andō, asked the troupe to dress up in traditional garb (which they had at the ready) and play music for Forman's movie camera (see Figure 2). Forman wrote in his published account that the Sao were "a tribe of former headhunters," in keeping with the putative theme of his book chapter. But to his Japanese minders, the Sao symbolized, with numbing consistency, the musical and pacific side of Indigenous culture. Numerous and varied Japanese-language tourist literature boasted that these "civilized savages" were several centuries removed from head-hunting. The unpublished negatives of Forman's Sao visit confirm the impression made by his travelogue: his encounter with the Sao was brief, routine and structured by a commercial transaction. His camera merely reproduced imagery that could be purchased at any souvenir shop in Taiwan for a few sen.

Forman's next vignette described his visit to a settlements near Wushe. Unlike the Sun Moon Lake site, Wushe was indeed a place where many a foreign head had been taken in the recent past (Japanese heads). And yet, conditions there were not much different from Sun Moon Lake by 1938. Upon his arrival in one village, the Atayal men greeted Japanese policemen with a "konnichi wa" and a bow. Forman's published and unpublished photos from Wushe suggest an isolated and content population. Again, Forman's pictures among the Wushe-area Atayal people closely resembled mass-produced Japanese postcards from the era, and were perhaps inspired by them.

Forman's upland photo shoots were broken up by rests at attractive and comfortable inns. And these, reported interpreter Andō, were to be found throughout the island. Forman's acquaintance US Consul Gerald Warner took photos of a number of such inns, which were appointed with verandas, tatami-mat rooms, and dining areas. Forman himself remarked that the
mountain area looked like a regular resort complex, though he noted quizzically that outsiders
did not seem particularly welcome.

In his references to historical events, Forman the newsreel correspondent conjured up a
recent past seemingly as bloody and perilous as the urban battlefields of continental China.
Based on written sources made available to him by his hosts, and from discussions with Mr.
Ando the interpreter (who must have been a government plant), Forman told the story of the
guardline-policy and military expeditions against the Atayal and Taroko peoples in northern
Taiwan. Forman also provided a brief sketch of the Wushe Rebellion. Whereas Forman
reasoned (nearly correctly) that the Japanese forces exterminated the surviving Wushe males
after the rebellion, Andō claimed, and Forman relayed, that the rebels were merely "scolded."
Forman attributed the rebellion to a surfeit of gapers much like himself who observed the
villagers "like animals in a zoo." The virile men could not be defeated, continued Forman, by
Japanese expeditions, but were only brought down by the use of poison gas. Further
accentuating their bellicosity, Forman wrote that the Indigenous Peoples had been much more
difficult to subjugate than Taiwan's Han Taiwanese in the early years of Japanese rule. In other
words, the subjects of Forman's photographs may have appeared as harmless attractions on the
ethnic-tourism route, but the lands he trod were soaked in the blood of their parents. But for all
of the violence and conflict in the past, Forman concluded with the observation that the Japanese

---

26 Forman's notebook cites the following as his major source: Bureau of Aboriginal Affairs, Report on the Control of the Aborigines in Formosa (Taipei: Taiwan Government General, 1911). This volume continues to be utilized as a source for Taiwan history. It is concerned with a period of particularly gruesome combat between Japanese military forces and Indigenous Peoples.

27 On October 27, 1930, several groups of Atayal warriors attacked Japanese Police boxes and a grade-school athletic exhibition and killed 134 people. Reprisals were swift and brutal, leaving well over 1000 local residents dead.

28 Wherever Forman's information on the Wushe Rebellion came from, it was not a printed Japanese official source. For one, the Japanese would never have admitted to using poison gas at Wushe (this is a point of debate in Japanese-language sources regarding Wushe). Moreover, Forman's reference to Mona Ludao, the leader of the rebellion, as a "university graduate," and the number of dead he recorded (187) simply inaccurate without the virtue of having any propagandistic value.
were enrolling Indigenous children into excellent schools to better "the life and lot of the natives." 29

Forman wound down his "headhunting" chapter with lengthy and uninspired summaries of various local traditions having no particular relation to his visit, the war, or Japanese policies. Forman's published account, then, is best characterized as a quasi-ethnological adventure story that had wandered far off the trail of the investigative report he purportedly came to Taiwan to write.

III. Harrison Forman in Colonial Taiwan

In his second Taiwan chapter of Horizon Hunters, Forman returned to current events. In 1938, Forman wrote, the Japanese had much more to fear from the five million Chinese on the island than the few "headhunting tribes" he had lavished so much attention upon in his travelogue. Forman reported that Taiwanese had sent intelligence to the KMT to warn of incoming Japanese attacks. The consequent Japanese "spy jitters," Forman explained, were set against "seething unrest" and a "hatred of overlords" in the cities. As it turns out, Forman's description of the escalating tensions between Japanese and Taiwanese only served as an explanation for why colonial police had become so vigilant in Taiwan. Again avoiding the war, Forman's second chapter is consumed by an account of his efforts to "smuggle" his newsreels out of Taiwan.

Forman's reticence regarding urban civil strife under Japanese rule cannot be attributed to a lack of opportunity to witness and learn about such conditions. Consul Gerald Warner, a generally punctilious correspondent, placed Forman in Taipei on May 22, 1938. 30 Though Forman's journal and published account do not give a specific date for his departure, it seems

29 Forman, Horizon Hunter, pp. 219-21 (quotation from p. 221).
30 Warner, "Typescript," p. 3.
safe to assume that Forman was in Taiwan for at least seven weeks, since it is certain that he arrived on April 1. In his published account, Forman claimed to have visited seven different Indigenous Peoples groups during his stay, each on a different trip.\textsuperscript{31} It is doubtful that any of these journeys lasted more than two days. Thus, Forman presumably had a month to look around at conditions in the rest of Taiwan.

According to his unpublished journal, Forman's first stop after clearing customs was the Twatutia Club in Taipei. There, in April 1938, Forman found a rump group of "18 foreigners—mostly consular [, and a] Few tea-merchants." The club was a "run down" establishment that featured foreign food and blind masseurs. From this crowd, Forman learned that Westerners had become unwelcome in Taiwan and were under tight scrutiny. All but a few Western companies had been forced out by excessive and arbitrary taxes or refusals to renew permits. Moreover, Japanese who had once been friendly to outsiders were now afraid to show kindness for fear of official retribution.\textsuperscript{32} Forman himself withheld the names of his hosts and Western informants, even in his notes, so tense was the atmosphere in Taipei. Nonetheless, the notebook and other sources, however obliquely, identify Forman's unnamed sources. The "jittery" man in the club called by Forman "Uncle Clarence" was Clarence Griffin, a local manager for Jardine Matheson and intimate of Gerald Warner, the US Consul to Taiwan.\textsuperscript{33} Classified police reports from 1937 singled Griffin out as someone to be watched for his extensive contacts with business and

\textsuperscript{31} Forman, Horizon Hunter, p. 230.

\textsuperscript{32} Harrison Forman, "Diary: Japan, Taiwan, Korea," Harrison Forman Papers, box 1, folder 7, Item 6. Special Collections and University Archives, University of Oregon Libraries. This journal is not paginated.

diplomatic communities in Taiwan and Hong Kong. In Warner's own scrapbooks, Harrison Forman's promotional materials are affixed, along with a notation that Forman visited the Warners in 1938.

In his personal correspondence, Consul Warner alluded to the fact that his mail was censored and that more generally foreigners were under tight scrutiny. His run-ins with police had become legion. In 1940, Warner's longtime interpreter, Matsuo Chūhei, was arrested and jailed. And Rella recalled in 1985, with hyperbole to be sure, that most of the Consul's staff had been "murdered or imprisoned" by the time they departed Taiwan in 1941. It is reasonable to surmise that Foreman's assessment of political conditions in Taiwan were heavily influenced by contact with this expatriate community. To have named them in his article would have exposed them to censure from the local constables, if not their respective bureaucratic higher-ups in the US Government or firms like Jardine and Matheson.

At the same time, Forman's notebook entries about his experiences outside of the Indigenous territories contain a good deal of information on the dissemination of imperial propaganda. Whether or not Forman's experiences were typical awaits further research. Nonetheless, the postcards, photographs, and brochures that he made reference to are well represented in existing collections and library holdings, which is to say that he was not collecting rare curios, but rather mass-produced materials containing significant admixtures of propaganda.

To begin with, we can surmise that Forman picked up a pamphlet or two and some postcards while under escort from the airport. Once left to the care of the local expatriates and interpreter Andō, his new cronies at the Twatutia Club supplemented the meager English-
language captions on his postcards as Forman quizzed them for his article. The following page of Forman's notebook contains descriptions of what appear to be common Taiwanese postcards, official statistics, and a reference to the British expatriate Clarence Griffin:

Great mass of literature printed on country for tourist and commercial trade—yet neither [are] welcomed!; Matriarchal State amongst Ami tribes; Bununs are opposite; Men all wear jewelry—like birds; Taiyals use bamboo; Moustache women are Tayals; Her wedding ring; Profile of Big Chief; [Illegible] in Face is TSUO; 148,000 natives. Tayal, Bunun, Ami, Tsuo, Saisetts, Paiwan, Yami; Earthquake Apr. 21, 1935; Griffin and his mitten-monkey; Tree 3,000 years; Communism-no money; Dogs brought by Dutch.37

Forman found it paradoxical that such visual plentitude existed side-by-side with stringent security on cameras. He wrote:

So much fuss and concern about photographing in J. Empire—no pix from more than 100 meters, etc.—yet you can buy for a few cents a picture of almost anything or place you want. The J. are inveterate camera enthusiasts and picture post-card buyers, and picture post-cards may be purchased at any R.R. station, shop, hotel, or refreshment stand.38

The dominant theme in Forman's unpublished observations of Taiwan Indigenous Peoples is economic hardship. His notes reveal why authorities were so laissez-faire about the distribution of printed photographs while being mindful to suppress unsupervised photography.

At the end of his notes, Forman wrote:

… well off … the…tourist track the natives … live in much poverty. The "Kon-ni-chi-wa" greeting here is quite conspicuous by its absence. Officials here apparently not proud of work. Would not allow pix of natives. Pathetic-looking in uniforms and clothes Hubbards. The chin-tattoo of a head-taker somehow looks incongruous together with uniform & cap and black stockings and split-toe shoes [emphasis added].39

Forman indicated that all trade was conducted at government posts. Indigenous cloth, featured so prominently in his photography, required two weeks of labor to produce a single garment, while second-hand Japanese clothing sold for about the price of two day's labor on a road gang.

37 Forman, "Diary: Japan, Taiwan, Korea."
38 Forman, "Diary: Japan, Taiwan, Korea."
39 Forman, "Diary: Japan, Taiwan, Korea."
These older garments were sent to the interior in bulk as part of an effort to "Japanize" Indigenous Peoples. Forman reported the going wage for road-building as 80 sen (.8 yen) per day. As an alternative to poorly paid road work, Forman noted, Indigenous hunters could earn 60 yen for an intact dear carcass, and even up to 300 yen for the right type of deer horns—or a whole year's road-work wages for one well-placed bullet or snare!! But the government rationed bullets carefully to prevent Indigenous Peoples from neglecting their farms. Sedentary agriculture, reported Forman, promised to "tame and control wild impulses." In other words, economically rational activities like hunting were discouraged in favor of labor-intensive modes of production, undoubtedly implemented to ease the government's surveillance of "former headhunters."

But even when anecdotal evidence of Indigenous economic prosperity could be found, Forman remained skeptical. He wrote: "Today [the Kappanzan men] are all dressed in a military uniform—by compulsion—and are growing soft with peace." "Not even our Indians were so humiliated, regimented and spirit broken." In sum, Forman's unpublished remarks are sober observations about the place of Taiwan Indigenous Peoples in a modern colonial political economy. That Forman used Native Americans as a reference point for much of his discussion suggests an ambivalence, and even sense of resignation, to the inevitability of the conditions he learned of from his guides, expatriate friends, or sources unknown. These remarks may have been discarded by an American editor concerned that gloomy prose might dampen sales, to be sure. But it is also worth noting that alternative sources of imagery of conditions beyond the model villages had become scarce indeed by 1938.

The familiar routes to the highlands taken by Forman and Warner had not been opened to casual travelers until 1910, when a light-gauge push-cart rail was built to connect Daxi (Dakekan)."
to Kappanzan/Jiaobanshan, at a length of 87.22 ri at a cost of 65,000 yen.41 As the terminus of this rail project, built at the height of the Japanese offensives against the neighboring Gaogan residents, Jiaobanshan was the staging area for Japanese military actions against the so-called Dakekan sub-groups of the Atayal. By 1912, Kappanzan was sufficiently pacified to be considered the site for a royal visit from the emperor himself.42 Just as the infrastructural and political conditions presupposed by ethnic tourism were being put into place, the Home Ministry, perhaps not coincidentally, banned the publication of postcards depicting head-hunting themes such as actual decapitations or skull shelves, in 1913,43 as if to lay the groundwork for shifting perceptions of the uplands from a place to be feared to a place to be enjoyed, or even protected.

By 1920 at the latest, the light-gauge push-cart rail that connected the town of Kappanzan to the main trunk railway stop at Daxi had become an artery for tourists, freight, and officials. Travelers ascended the mountain pushed by two Taiwanese laborers, with rest stations and inns all along the way.44 The local people of Kappanzan were objects of intense Japanese assimilation efforts. Photos of Japanese schools (run by police officers) filled with Indigenous children and Hinomaru flags decorated magazines, atlases and the ubiquitous picture postcards of the 1920s and 1930s. Much of the textual rhetoric accompanying these images extolled the conversion of a former head-hunting people into rice-growing, peace-loving, assimilating examples of Japanese success at carrying out the “yellow man’s burden.” Such was the physical and imaginative setting for Harrison Forman's eyewitness reporting on conditions in Taiwan.

As Barak Kushner has noted regarding Japanese imperial propaganda in the late 1930s and early 1940s, tourism was considered to be a potentially important means of selling the

---

42 Ide Kiwata, Taiwan chisekishi (Taipei: Taiwan nichinichi shinpōsha, 1937), p. 707.
43 Taiwan nichinichi shinpō June 11, 1913, p.2.
empire to foreigners. Thus, the government paid for many foreigners to visit Japan as tourists, and went even further to pay off journalists to write favorably about imperial policies.\[45\]

Although I have no direct evidence that Forman's trip was subsidized, or that he himself was paid off, his activities in Taiwan, and the resulting publication, could only have brought a smile to the faces of those who were spending considerable sums to obtain reportage such as that contained in *Horizon Hunter: The Adventures of a Modern Marco Polo*.